Tobacco Control Strategy for Wales and Delivery Plan: Consultation Document

ASH Wales is the only public health charity in Wales whose work is exclusively dedicated to tackling the harm that tobacco causes to communities. Though the evidence given here is solely on behalf of ASH Wales, we lead Wales' Tobacco Control Alliance and are a member UK's Smoke-free Action Coalition. In addition, ASH Wales is a member of Europe's Smoke-free Partnership.

Further information about our work can be found at :
ash.wales

ASH Wales has no direct or indirect links with and is not funded by the tobacco industry.

Abbreviations

AWMSG- All Wales Medicines Strategy Group
CRS- Corporate Social Responsibility
DHSC-Department of Health and Social Care
EC- E-cigarettes
FCTC- Framework Convention on Tobacco Control
MMC- Mass Media Campaign
NICE- National Institute for Clinical Excellence
NRT-Nicotine Replacement Therapy
OMSC- Ottawa Model for Smoking Cessation
PHW- Public Health Wales
SCS-Smoking Cessation Services
SES-Socioeconomic status
SHRN-School Health Research Network
TCDP- Tobacco Control Delivery Plan
WG- Welsh Government
WHO- World Health Organisation

Consultations Questions

Question 1

It is our ambition to become a smoke-free Wales by 2030 (smoke-free means that 5% or less of adults in Wales smoke). All our actions over the next 8 years will work towards and contribute to achieving this.

Do you agree with our ambition of Wales becoming smoke-free by 2030?

[Yes]

Please explain why our ambition is right or how our ambition would need to change if you think a different approach is needed.

ASH Wales strongly supports Welsh Government's ambition for a smoke-free society by 2030 (less than 5% of the adult population smoking) and believes the plan sets a welcome and essential framework for action. ASH Wales and partners have campaigned for an Endgame target to provide a lever to increase the pace of change within smoking prevalence. In addition, there is clear public support (73%, including 40% of smokers surveyed) for Wales to set an Endgame date of 2030[1].

Smoking is still the leading cause of preventable death in Wales[2]. Progress has been made, however, there is a clear need to increase the pace of change, build on and accelerate existing interventions as well as deliver new initiatives outlined within the strategy. Modelling by CRUK in 2020 indicates that, if current actions continue, Wales will not reach a smoke-free future until 2037[3]. The modelling also expects that the UK's most deprived SES groups will reach smoke-free much later than their least deprived counterparts.

Given the strategy's commitment to reducing inequalities, ASH Wales recommends that this commitment is reflected within the Endgame target. To ensure that no smoker is left behind, the 5% target should be applied across all priority groups. However, to ensure progress is not hindered whilst target metrics are established, we recommend the 5% target is extended in later editions of the TCDP.

In context to the rest of the UK, neighbouring countries have outlined similar smoke-free ambitions. England has set its goal to be smoke-free by 2030[4]. Scotland is aiming to secure a tobacco free generation by 2034 [5]. In 2012, Northern Ireland released a 10 year tobacco control strategy aiming to create a tobacco-free society[6]. In light of this, Wales' 2030 ambition is aligned to actions in other UK nations.

As Scotland highlighted in its latest strategy to become smoke-free, Wales should also strive towards this goal without stigmatising smokers. ASH Wales welcomes the evidenced-based approach to view smoking as an addiction, as this will draw attention to the counter measures to address that

---

[1] ASH Wales. YouGov Survey 2021
[2] NHS Wales. Health in Wales | New evidence shows that smoking remains the biggest cause of preventable ill health in Wales .2019
[3] CRUK. Smoking prevalence projections for England, Scotland, Wales, and Northern Ireland, based on data to 2018/19 2020
[4] Department of Health & Social Care. Advancing our health: prevention in the 2020s – consultation document - GOV.UK 2019
[5] Scottish Population Health Directorate. Raising Scotland's tobacco free generation: our tobacco control action plan 2018-gov scot 2018
[6] NI Department of Health. Tobacco control | Department of Health (health-ni.gov.uk) 2012

addiction[7]. ASH Wales believes that this approach should be adopted across all clinical settings to maximise the impact of interventions.

ASH Wales believes that monitoring, reporting and sufficient funding for the actions to make Wales smoke-free will be key to the success of the strategy. To change the pace and achieve a smoke-free Wales by 2030, there will clearly need to be increased monitoring, accountability and additional ring-fenced funding for all priority action areas.

ASH Wales Recommends:

- A 5% Endgame target across all priority groups set in later versions of the TCDP
- The approach to treat smoking as an addiction to be adopted, with particular attention to clinical settings.
- Increased monitoring, accountability and additional ring-fenced funding for tobacco control measures.

Question 2

The strategy sets out three themes under which we will work as we drive forward the changes in smoking in Wales:

Theme 1: Reducing Inequalities
Theme 2: Future Generations
Theme 3: A Whole-System Approach for a Smoke-Free Wales

Do you agree that these are the right themes to focus the strategy around?

[Yes]

Please explain why you consider the themes are right or if you think a different approach is needed.

ASH Wales agrees with the three broad themes. However, evidence-based actions that have the most impact on smoking prevalence should be prioritised within these themes.

It is also important to ensure actions to reduce uptake and increase quit attempts do not exacerbate inequalities caused by tobacco use. The themes and actions should universally seek to reduce inequalities and address the difference in life expectancy between the least and most deprived areas in Wales, which has shown little improvement in a decade.

Former plans and actions have been based on firm strategies, however actions, monitoring and funding have been heavily weighted towards the success of smoking cessation services to change individual behaviour. Furthermore, legislative changes to increase smokefree environments and reduce access to tobacco products by young people have not been adequately funded, implemented or enforced. In addition, work to reach priority groups through innovative methods has not been undertaken on a national level.

It is important that the new strategy broadens its scope to tackle smoking prevalence from new angles to ensure the new plan is future proof and impactful. light of this, we are reassured by the actions relayed within the strategy and delivery plan.

---

[7] West R, Christmas S, Hastings J, Michie S. Developing general models and theories of addiction 2017

In addition, it is essential that a pathway is mapped for these themes to feed into other government frameworks and strategies such as supporting mental health, reducing our environmental impact, tackling drug and alcohol misuse and community safety. ASH Wales believes this will cohere to the 'whole system approach' of the strategy, whereby all government mechanisms and levers are fully utilised to achieve the smoke-free ambition.

ASH Wales recognises the importance of all three themes, and the impact each holds on the tobacco control landscape in Wales. In light of this, we recommend that they are not numbered, and that they are equally prioritised throughout the strategy.

ASH Wales Recommends:

- Analysis of impact of actions undertaken
- Evidence-based actions with the most impact are prioritised
- Ensure actions reduce and not exacerbate inequalities caused by tobacco use
- WG ensures tobacco control principles are embedded across all relevant policy areas
- Themes are shown equal importance, and not numbered

Overview of themes:

Reducing Inequalities

ASH Wales fully supports the inclusion of 'reducing inequalities' as a theme, as smoking related inequalities place a disproportionate burden of ill health on specific groups in Wales.

Evidence shows adults in the three most economically deprived areas of Wales are more likely to smoke than the two least deprived areas[8]. This is mirrored in Welsh youth, as young people from less affluent families are twice as likely as those from more affluent families to report current smoking (6% vs. 3%)[9]. Such inequalities are echoed throughout priority groups outlined within the strategy.

Modelling from CRUK predicts that the UK's most deprived SES groups are predicted to reach a smoke-free goal much later than 2030. To curtail this projection, ASH Wales recommends that research into tailored support for lower SES groups is undertaken within the 2022-24 timeframe**.** Furthermore, given the strategies commitment to reducing health inequalities within priority groups, we recommend that research is extended into these groups. ASH Wales believes the evidence around smoking cessation support for priority groups in Wales needs to be reviewed in order to; identify gaps, assess which interventions work and where the most impact can be made. Currently, the evidence-base in this area is lacking.

It would be beneficial to secure data streams within the first phase of the TCDP, to assess which groups access smoking cessation services, and quit methods used in Wales. This would help monitoring and ensure services are based around the needs of the service users in Wales.

Given Wales' well-connected healthcare and smoking cessation infrastructure, ASH Wales believes the service is ideally placed to be at the forefront of innovation and intervention. A key element of the plan should be to ensure smoking cessation services are well funded and innovation is an

[8] NSW . National Survey for Wales 2018-19: adult smoking and e-cigarette use 2019
[9] SHRN. Report of the 2019/20 School Health Research Network Student Health and Wellbeing Survey 2021

embedded practice. Wales has an opportunity to share learning within this field at a UK and international level.

ASH Wales Recommends:

- Secure data streams in the first phase of the TCDP, to assess access to services by priority groups and quit methods used.
- Fund research to increase the understanding of the interventions that work best for each priority group.
- Ensure smoking services are appropriately funded and innovation is embedded.
- Sharing findings within this field.

Future Generations

ASH Wales supports the inclusion of 'future generations' as a theme for the strategy.

According to the latest maternity and birth statistics, around one in six (17%) Welsh mothers were recorded as smokers at their initial assessment in 2020[10]. The rate is much higher in younger mothers, where a third (33%) of women aged under 20 smoked, while only just over a tenth (12%) of women aged over 35 smoked[11]. Maternal smoking prevalence has been proven to have a significant impact on uptake amongst young people.

In addition, youth smoking rates remain stubbornly high with 8% of 15-16 year-olds smoking on a regular basis, a figure that has not changed since 2013[12]. Therefore, a theme to address the uptake and the protection of future generations is welcomed.

ASH Wales recommends that a focus on actions with the greatest impact should be a key consideration within this theme.

ASH Wales supports all the aims outlined within this theme. However, we recommend that additional care is taken in action to 'discourage the uptake of e-cigarettes or other nicotine products in teenagers and young people'[13]. ASH Wales is strongly supportive of discouraging youth from taking up tobacco smoking, e-cigarettes and various nicotine products. However, we believe that measures introduced should not place barriers for smokers to access e-cigarettes as an effective and evidence-based cessation tool.

To safeguard against mixed messaging (in media campaigns, cessation services and clinical advice), a collective stance on e-cigarettes should be established. ASH Wales recommends that a WG stance should promote e-cigarettes as a less-harmful tobacco alternative, while simultaneously discouraging use amongst youth and 'never smokers'. This harm reduction approach is outlined in more detail in section 7.

ASH Wales Recommends:

- A focus on actions with the greatest impact should be a key consideration.
- Ensure efforts to discourage vaping among young people do not place disproportionate barriers to smokers who use such products as smoking cessation tools.

[10] Statistics and Research. Maternity and birth Statistics-Welsh Gov 2020
[11] Statistics and Research. Maternity and birth Statistics-Welsh Gov 2020
[12] SHRN. Report of the 2019/20 School Health Research Network Student Health and Wellbeing Survey 2021
[13] Welsh Government .A SMOKE-FREE WALES - Our Long Term Tobacci Control Strategy for Wales 2020

A Whole-System Approach for a Smoke-Free Wales

ASH Wales supports the inclusion of ‘a whole-system approach’ as a theme for the strategy. As the strategy rightly highlights, Wales must work together in a collective effort to ensure that all levers, mechanisms and systems are fully utilised to achieve the smoke-free ambition.

ASH Wales strongly supports all action points outlined in this theme. ASH Wales highlights the importance of the below action point:

- Support collaboration by ensuring the actions of all partners are co-ordinated at a local, regional and national level, and together contribute towards a smoke-free Wales[14].

ASH Wales emphasises the importance of collaboration, especially in context to the third sector, as many organisations have established networks, programmes and bodies of work relating to tobacco control in Wales. ASH Wales believes that such collaboration will cohere well to the whole system approach of the strategy, and will maximise the TCDP’s efforts. ASH Wales believes that robust coordination from WG would support this.

ASH Wales Recommends:

- Smoking cessation and general data to be transparent and readily available throughout the TCDP, particularly for third-sector organisations and key partners.
- TCDP workgroups to be held bi-annually to ensure sound communication, direction and partnership.

[14] Welsh Government. A SMOKE-FREE WALES - Our Long Term Tobacci Control Strategy for Wales 2020

Question 3
Whilst we have established that it is our ambition to achieve a smoke-free Wales by 2030, we have not set milestone smoking prevalence targets in our strategy or set a smoking prevalence rate that we will look to achieve by the end of the first delivery plan. However, our aim is for a step-wise reduction in smoking prevalence over the next 8 years. We will use the following data sources to monitoring smoking rates in Wales:

- National Survey for Wales which provides data on smoking in Wales and provides a smoking prevalence rate. Student Health and Wellbeing in Wales survey for smoking and vaping behaviours in young people aged 11-16.
- Maternity and birth statistics for maternal smoking rates.

Do you feel this is the right approach?

[Partly]

Please explain why this is the right approach or if you think a different approach is needed.

ASH Wales believes that a step-wise approach should be given a fuller explanation, as this could mean a steady decline or a series of steep drops followed by plateaus. The latter suggests a series of high impact actions causing significant declines in overall smoking prevalence in Wales. ASH Wales is highly supportive of the second, as it suggests that high impact actions will be adopted throughout the strategy, which is arguably necessary to reach the 2030 ambition.

While the strategy outlines that it will not set milestone targets, we believe that targets will be useful to steer action in later editions of the TCDP, to ensure progress is sustained throughout the strategy.

The first series of the plan should focus on creating solid data-pathways, with a firm focus on securing data sets for priority groups in Wales.

While overall smoking prevalence decreases in Wales, rates within certain groups remain stubbornly high, thus perpetuating inequalities. Therefore, we stress the importance of extending the 5% Endgame target across all priority groups in Wales. This will help to ensure that reducing inequalities is hardwired into actions areas across the strategy. We recommend WG commit to extending this target in later editions of the TCDP.

ASH Wales recognises some actions to address tobacco use will have a greater and more immediate impact than others. However, interim targets will drive action and ensure consistent progress.

As smoking prevalence is decreasing, ASH Wales believes using the national figures for overall smoking in the adult population may mask greater declines in the least deprived areas compared with the most deprived. Therefore, ASH Wales believes that in addition to extending the 5% Endgame target, interim targets should also be set to monitor progress within priority groups. This would ensure inequalities caused by tobacco use are addressed in a timely manner.

Monitoring through the outlined sources will provide a sound platform to measure broad progress, however, there are opportunities to harvest data from sources which are not currently being realised. These have been outlined in more detail within the following section.

Within this area, it is also important that data on smoking related behaviours are standardised and transparent. Data collection issues have led to uncertainty in the credibility of national data sets, which unless addressed will hinder any assessment of progress.

ASH Wales Recommends:

- A clear definition of a step-wise approach.
- A commitment to setting interim targets for priority groups, within later editions of the TCDP.
- Standardised and transparent data collection methods.
- The utilisation of existing data sources to monitor and report on:
  - Smoking rates 16-24 year olds
  - Socio-economically deprived groups: with tailored questions on smoking habits and trends.
  - Quit attempts and successful quits
  - Pregnant people with a particular focus on 15 to 19-year-olds: Maternity and birth statistics for maternal smoking rates.

Question 4

Are there any other data sources that should be used to monitor the success of the strategy and delivery plan? If so, what would they be?

Please provide additional comments

It is important to note that measuring uptake in 16-24 year olds, quit attempts and successful quit attempts have been cited as useful tools in assessing the impact of actions on prevalence.

ASH Wales recommends additional data sources to include:

Welsh Government to ensure;

- the National Survey for Wales records the following questions as standard;
  - Smoking and cannabis use
  - Quit attempts
  - Methods used to quit
  - Smoking and cannabis prevalence of 16-18 year-olds
- Track and Trace data collected quarterly (retail prevalence and market activity)

Public Health Wales to ensure Smoking Cessation Statistics include;

- Deprivation area analysis uptake of services and successful quits

Local Health Boards to ensure;

- Smoking and cannabis use is recorded;
  - In all primary and secondary care
  - For all patients living with a long-term mental health condition
  - All dental patients
- VBA and referrals recorded in all clinical settings

Local Authorities to gather annual Tobacco Control Surveys on a range of data including;

- Under age sales
- Enforcement activity relating to illegal tobacco and vapes
- Enforcement activity relating to smokefree spaces
- Environmental data to record cigarette litter

Third Sector and External Partners;

- Biennial data on the prevalence of illegal tobacco (NEMS survey)
- YouGov Survey of public attitudes towards tobacco control
- Statistics from Wales's Smoking Toolkit Survey

ASH Wales recognises that data gaps exist for smoking prevalence within 16- to 18-year-old high risk young adults, social housing tenants, routine and manual workers, mental health, the adult LGBT community and ethnic minority groups. It would be beneficial to review where data gaps exist for priority groups, to monitor broad progress within this area of the TCDP.

Recommendation:

- Assess where data gaps exist for priority groups, to monitor broad progress within this area of the TCDP.

Question 5

To support delivery of the strategy it is our intention to publish a series of two-year delivery plans. Do you agree that we organise our actions into two-year delivery plans?

[Yes]

Please explain why the structure works well or outline how it could be made better.

ASH Wales believes 2 years provides enough adjustment time and sets a firm framework for delivery and measuring targets. In context to timeframes, ASH Wales highlights the importance of securing solid data pathways within the first phase of the TCDP. This would ensure that time is not lost through data gathering, and that a review of each series of the TCDP can be easily achieved.

Towards the end of each series, it would be beneficial to set time aside to assess progress and plan the next TCDP phase. This would be conducted before each plan is finished. This would ensure that the two-year time frame is fully utilised, and that focus is steered towards action.

ASH Wales recommends that a half-way review is planned and carried out within the strategy. This half-way review would be scheduled for 2026 and would allow WG to gather evidence and consult on the last series of the TCDP. Within this, partners and external organisations would be invited to share thoughts and contribute to the formation of the latter half of the TCDP. This 'half-way' mark would also allow WG to relay TCDP progress and highlight areas that need focus to secure the 2030 target.

ASH Wales recommends:

- Secure data pathways within the first TCDP, to ensure efficient monitoring and review.
- WG to factor in time for planning and review before the end of each TCDP phase.

- A planned half-way review of the strategy.

Question 6

In the first two-year delivery plan, which covers April 2022 – March 2024, we have grouped the actions we will take into five priority action areas:

Priority Action Area 1: Smoke-Free environments
Priority Action Area 2: Continuous improvement and supporting innovation
Priority Action Area 3: Priority groups
Priority Action Area 4: Tackle illegal tobacco and the tobacco control legal framework
Priority Action Area 5: Working across the UK

Do you agree that these are the right priority action areas to focus the 2022-2024 delivery plan around?

[Yes]

Please explain why you consider the priority action areas are right or if you think a different approach is needed.

ASH Wales believes the five priority areas are correct. However, ASH Wales recommends that the order of these areas should be more reflective of their relative impact on smoking prevalence in Wales.

At this stage, it would be beneficial to outline the workflow, time and resources needed to achieve the action points within priority areas. Breaking the priority areas down into what can be achieved within the eight-year timeframe will allow WG and other accountable bodies to plan accordingly.

ASH Wales are pleased that WG have pre-empted key actions within the priority action areas, ahead of the first phase of the TCDP. For example, WG's work with Public Health Wales to create the Help Me Quit Hospital model, which will provide a systematic cessation service for those in secondary care. We recommend that this proactive approach is carried throughout the TCDP.

ASH Wales Recommends:

- Ordering priority actions by the greatest impact on smoking prevalence.
- Breaking priority action areas down to assess workflow, time, and resources to effectively plan and fully utilise the eight-year timeframe.
- WG to continue a proactive approach within areas which hold a high impact and strong evidence base (i.e., systemic secondary care system based on the effective Ottawa/CURE Model).

Question 7
We have developed a number of actions within each priority action area. Do you feel these are the right ones?

[Partly]

Please explain why the actions are right or how they can be improved.

Priority action area 1: Smoke-Free environments

ASH Wales supports all actions depicted in Priority Action Area 1. Evidence shows smoke-free legislation can improve health outcomes through a reduction in second-hand smoke[15], and has a positive influence on smoking behaviour and social norms[16].

Wales is the first UK nation to impose legislative bans on smoking in hospital grounds, playgrounds, and school grounds. ASH Wales recommends a review of the existing legislation, while scoping opportunities to enhance the impact of smokefree environments.

In addition, the added value of third sector partnerships in this area should be promoted throughout this action area. In 2021, the implementation of smoke-free school gates enabled ASH Wales and Public Health Wales to work together to place advertising outside over 20 percent of schools in Wales, which in turn promoted the benefits and merits smokefree spaces.

When it comes to long-term changes in smoking prevalence a Cochrane review conducted in 2010 concluded that evidence is inconsistent in this area[17]. In light of this, ASH Wales recommends that additional legislative work expanding smoke-free spaces should not be prioritised over actions which may hold a greater impact.

However, ASH Wales believes the promotion of voluntary smokefree spaces in publicly-funded bodies would avoid lengthy legislative changes whilst also creating the pathway for expansion, innovation, cross-government working and third sector partnerships. ASH Wales also believes there is scope for this programme of work to be incentivised.

In addition, ASH Wales believes the following should be considered within this workstream:

- **Monitoring implementation of existing smoke-free spaces**

ASH Wales supports WG action to monitor implementation of all existing smoke-free spaces. Our feedback from partners highlights that recently implemented smoke-free spaces are not consistently adhered to across Wales, with smoke-free hospital grounds being a particular concern. However, to steer action, a review of existing smoke-free spaces should be conducted with the remit of exploring opportunities to promote cessation services.

- **Full and timely implementation of planned smoke-free spaces**

Through the Public Health Wales Act (2017), Welsh Ministers have expanded smoke-free spaces in Wales[18]. From March 2022, smoke-free environments are planned to be implemented in bedrooms

[15] Frazer K, Callinan J, McHugh J, Van Baarsel S, Clarke A, Doherty K, Kelleher C. Legislative smoking bans for reducing harms from secondhand smoke exposure, smoking prevalence and tobacco consumption, 2016
[16] Bauld, L. Impact of smokefree legislation in England: Evidence review .2011
[17] Callinan JE, Clarke A, Doherty K, Kelleher C. Legislative smoking bans for reducing secondhand smoke exposure, smoking prevalence and tobacco consumption Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews, Issue 4. Art. No. CD005992. DoI: 10.1002/14651858.pub2. 2010
[18] Welsh Government. The Smoke-free Premises and Vehicles (Wales) Regulations 2020

in hotels, guest houses, all self-contained holiday accommodation[19]. In September 2022, smoking rooms are also due to be phased out of all Mental Health Units in Wales[20]. ASH Wales would recommend that planned smoke-free spaces are implemented in a timely manner, and that actions include the promotion of cessation services and maximising impact.

- **Supporting the Help Me Quit Hospital Model: Smoke-free hospital grounds**

Through the Public Health Wales Act (2017), Welsh Ministers enacted law which required hospitals in Wales to be smoke-free[21]. In March 2021, every hospital site across Wales became smoke-free. The rationale for the legislation was to protect public health, discouraging smoking and 'supporting those trying to quit'[22]. In light of this, ASH Wales recommends:

- A reminder of smoke-free legislation within hospital appointment letters.
- Hospital letters to include a QR code referring patients to cessation services and guidance on NRT.

ASH Wales recommends:

- A review of current smoke-free spaces, as outlined in action 1
- An incentivised programme to promote voluntary smoke-free spaces within publicly funded bodies
- Promote third sector partnerships to maximise the impact of smoke-free spaces
- Full and timely implementation of planned smoke-free spaces
- Supporting smoke-free hospital grounds (smoke-free policy and QR codes offering smoking cessation advice and services on hospital appointment letters)
- Legislative action within this area is not prioritised over actions in other TCDP areas which may hold a greater impact

Priority Action Area 2: Continuous improvement and supporting innovation

ASH Wales supports all the actions within priority action area 2, and strongly supports plans to develop a systematic secondary care service for Wales.

As previously outlined, evidence-based actions which hold the greatest impact should be prioritised throughout the strategy. In light of this, we welcome the actions included within this area. As the Deputy Minister outlines in her forward to the long-term strategy: ambition and meaningful change are necessary for Wales to achieve its 2030 ambition. In context to this area of the TCDP, for meaningful change to be realised a step-change is necessary to strengthen smoking cessation services in Wales. From March 2020 to April 2021, 3.34% of smokers in Wales made a quit attempt using Help Me Quit services[23]. To reach our 2030 ambition, there needs to be a steep rise in those accessing services in Wales. Thus, we are pleased that cessation services are being strengthened, and have included recommendations on how these services can be expanded.

Additional improvements to outlined actions have been included below.

i.) A systematic secondary care smoking cessation service in Wales

[19] Welsh Government. Smoke-free law: guidance on the changes from March 2021 GOV.WALES 2022
[20] Welsh Government. Smoke-free law: guidance on the changes from March 2021 GOV.WALES 2022
[21] Welsh Government. Smoke-free law: guidance on the changes from March 2021 GOV.WALES 2022
[22] Welsh Government. Ban on smoking on hospital grounds comes into force in Wales | GOV.WALES 2021
[23] Welsh Government. NHS smoking cessation services 2020-2021 2021

ASH Wales recognises the importance of a systematic secondary care smoking cessation service in Wales, and views this as a crucial element of the TCDP. The service will incorporate learnings from the effective Ottawa/CURE Model for Smoking Cessation, which consists of the following principles:

- The systematic identification and documentation of all smokers admitted to hospital.
- The systematic administration of pharmacotherapy and behavioural support to active smokers in hospital.
- The systematic attachment to long term community follow-up services after discharge, with printed recommendations for continuing pharmacotherapies post-discharge.

The Ottawa Model for Smoking Cessation provides a system of care that ensures all smokers admitted to secondary care settings are offered smoking cessation treatment[24]. It is an opt-out model, where smoking status is recorded, and a clinical approach is provided. The process has been implemented across 120 hospitals in Canada and has been proven to increase long term quit rates by 11%[25].

ASH Wales highlights the importance of the timely-implementation of these key evidence-based principles within Wales' own secondary care service, which will be referred to as the Help Me Quit Hospital Model.

The merits of this approach are apparent in The CURE Project in Greater Manchester, which implemented the Ottawa model and recorded a 42% quit rate within the first six months of rollout[26].

Whilst developing the Wales version of the opt-out model it is important to ensure services are created that fit around the service user. The approach to treating secondary care patients differs from the existing Help Me Quit model, and therefore services will need to be flexible. It is important that we build on and accelerate existing interventions whilst pursuing innovation and improvement.

The ability to share data across service providers will be a key element to the success of this model and will ensure smokers are seamlessly transferred from clinical to community services.

To maximise this TCDP action, ASH Wales recommends that this programme of work is expanded to include:

- **Mandatory training for nurses to deliver Very Brief Advice.**

Nurses belong to one of the largest groups of healthcare providers in Wales, who have an extended reach into the population of tobacco users[27]. Thus, increasing the number of nurses who deliver brief evidence-based interventions for tobacco use and dependence, such as that prescribed by PHW, is likely to expose more tobacco users to evidence-based treatments and lead to more successful quit attempts.

However, effective training is key to improving provider proficiency in delivering evidence-based interventions for tobacco use. A US study of 359 nurses, which monitored the outcome of a single hour of didactic smoking cessation training, found significant positive increases in the participants competency to carry out effective smoking cessation support[28].

---

[24] University of Ottawa Heart Institute. About OMSC | Ottawa Model for Smoking Cessation 2022
[25] University of Ottawa Heart Institute. Program Effectiveness | Ottawa Model for Smoking Cessation (ottawaheart.ca) 2022
[26] Greater Manchester Health & Social Care Partnership. Outcomes – The CURE Project 2019
[27] Royal College of Nursing Wales. The Nursing Workforce in Wales 2020
[28] Sheffer C, Barone C, Anders M. Training Nurses in the Treatment of Tobacco Use and Dependence: Pre- and Post-Training Results 2011

ASH Wales recommends that nurses undergo mandatory training as part of the introduction of the Help Me Quit Hospital Model, with the ambition to extend this training to nurses working within primary care.

- **Smoking cessation training (Very Brief Advice) for additional patient-facing occupations.**

ASH Wales suggests that additional patient-facing primary and secondary staff receive mandatory VBA training. This would include nursing assistants, hospital porters, pharmacy assistants, and General Practice staff.

- **Expansion of the Ottawa model into primary care.**

The Ottawa Model for Smoking Cessation has been has adapted for application in primary care settings, with the OMSC programme highlighting that it can be implemented without noticeable impact on patient flow[29].

Given the effectiveness of the OMSC model, ASH Wales recommends it is also implemented within primary care settings in Wales. This body of work would fit within The Help Me Quit Hospital Model, and its expansion in later editions of the TCDP. We suggest that core OMSC/CURE principles are applied within this area of work.

ASH Wales recommends**:**

- Creating a systematic secondary care smoking cessation system, which includes the Ottawa/CURE Model's key principles.
- Create services that suit the needs of the service user.
- Ensure the seamless transition of smokers from clinical to community services through an established data-sharing system.
- Mandatory training of nurses to deliver VBA, as part of the introduction of the Help Me Quit Hospital Model.
- Explore the scope to deliver VBA to nurses working within primary care
- Explore the scope to deliver VBA to additional patient facing occupations
- Expansion of the Wales version of the Ottawa Model into primary care

ii.) Review e-cigarettes as a smoking cessation tool

- **E-cigarettes: an evidence-based position statement**

ASH Wales welcomes the Welsh Government's commitment to explore the role of e-cigarettes as a smoking cessation tool [30]. However, ASH Wales believes Wales urgently needs an evidence-based position statement on e-cigarettes to inform smokers, healthcare professionals and members of the public. To combat growing misconceptions in Wales, the statement should focus on the relative harms and the use of e-cigarettes as an effective smoking cessation tool.

ASH Wales recommends the positions statement reflects:

- Current evidence shows e-cigarettes are considerably less harmful than tobacco
- E-cigarettes are an effective smoking cessation tool, particularly when combined with behavioural support[31].

---

[29]University of Ottawa Heart Institute. Primary Care | Ottawa Model for Smoking Cessation 2022
[30] Welsh Government. A SMOKE-FREE WALES - Our Long Term Tobacci Control Strategy for Wales 2020
[31] Hajek P, et al. A Randomized Trial of E-Cigarettes versus Nicotine-Replacement Therapy 2019

- WG supports the adoption of a harm reduction approach when it comes to the use of e-cigarettes as a smoking cessation tool.

The current assessment by Public Health England is that vaping is at least 95% less harmful than smoking tobacco[32]. This is consistent with the findings of the Royal College of Physicians in 2016, that relayed "the hazard to health arising from long-term vapour inhalation from the e-cigarettes available today is unlikely to exceed 5% of the harm from smoking tobacco''[33].Furthermore, reviews comparing the cancer potencies of e-cigarettes with tobacco show that the lifetime cancer risk of vaping has been assessed to be under 1% of the risk of smoking[34].

Public misconception: Despite the current evidence base, a recent ASH Wales survey (2021) found that 33% of Welsh adults wrongly believe e-cigarettes to be as harmful or more harmful than tobacco cigarettes, an increase from 25% in 2018, from 14% in 2017 [35].

In light of the above, ASH Wales recommends that the Welsh Government issues a collective position statement relaying what is known about e-cigarettes, outlining their relative risk against the considerable risks of tobacco. This stance should align with the published position of Public Health England and the UK Government and support the NICE recommendation to 'give clear, consistent and up-to-date information about nicotine-containing e-cigarettes to adults who are interested in using them to stop smoking' (1.12.13) [36] [37]. Through ASH Wales' work with healthcare providers, the lack of a unified position has led to confusion and misunderstanding within cessation support efforts in Wales.

When considering this recommendation, we advise that Welsh Government reviews *Nicotine Without Smoke: Tobacco Harm Reduction*, a report from The Royal College of Physicians [38]. This report includes a strong argument to adopt e-cigarettes within a harm reduction approach to smoking and highlights how such an approach can curtail the death and disability caused by tobacco use.

- **E-cigarettes to be offered within smoking cessation services in Wales.**

ASH Wales supports the WG's action to explore the role of e-cigarettes as a smoking cessation tool. In addition to our recommendation of a current WG stance on e-cigarettes, we recommend that e-cigarettes are offered within smoking cessation support services in Wales.

The MHRA have recently enhanced guidance to allow e-cigarettes manufacturers to acquire medical licences for their products[39]. ASH Wales views this as a progressive move, which will allow e-cigarettes to undergo a defined standard set by the medicine's regulator. This in turn will open the possibility for clinicians to prescribe e-cigarettes within smoking cessation efforts in Wales.

In Wales, prescribing e-cigarettes within SCS would be up to the discretion of individual health boards. Health boards in Wales would base this decision on guidance provided by NICE or the

---

[32] McNeill A, et al. Evidence review of e-cigarettes and heated tobacco products: Report commissioned by Public Health England 2018
[33] Royal College of Physicians. Nicotine without smoke: Tobacco harm reduction 2016
[34] Stephens WE. Comparing the cancer potencies of emissions from vapourised nicotine products including e-cigarettes with those of tobacco smoke 2017
[35] ASH Wales. YouGov Survey 2021
[36] UK Government. PHE publishes independent expert e-cigarettes evidence review 2018
[37] NICE. Tobacco: preventing uptake, promoting quitting and treating dependence 2021
[38] Royal College of Physicians. Nicotine without smoke: Tobacco harm reduction 2016
[39] BBC News Article. E-cigarettes could be available on NHS to tackle smoking rates - BBC News 2021

AWMSG. In addition to this, health boards would prescribe EC based on guidance from Welsh Government or Public Health Wales.

The current evidence-base outlines that e-cigarettes are a less-harmful alternative to tobacco[40]. In 2018, Public Health England published an expert independent review which concluded that e-cigarettes are 95% less harmful than smoking[41]. However, despite growing evidence drawing the consensus that vaping is considerably less harmful than smoking, it is not without risk. ASH Wales suggests that WG adopts a harm-reduction approach by weighing the significant harms of tobacco against the significantly reduced risks of EC and using this approach to steer policy.

In Wales, e-cigarettes are the most commonly used method to stop smoking, with the most common reason for using e-cigarettes being to help stop smoking tobacco (76% of current users)[42]. An ongoing Cochrane review assessing the effectiveness of e-cigarettes has also shown them to increase tobacco quit rates, when compared to other forms of NRT[43]. In addition to the above, NICE includes nicotine containing e-cigarettes within its recommendations for smoking interventions for adults (1.12.2)[44].

ASH Wales recommends:

- Update policy to outline a harm reduction approach to e-cigarettes.
- Work with PHW to facilitate the inclusion of e-cigarettes within smoking cessation services in Wales.
- Create a position statement for e-cigarettes that reflects the evidence base, that does not stigmatise users, and supports health professionals in the delivery of EC advice.

iii.) Digital solutions for smoking cessation support

ASH Wales welcomes WG's plans to explore innovative and digital methods to reduce smoking uptake and promote smoking cessation and believes this action should be priority in the 2022-24 timeframe.

In Wales, it is estimated that 45% of adult smokers try to quit each year[45]. Despite this, less than 3.3% of people trying to quit seek support through smoking cessation services in Wales, which means the vast majority of smokers attempt to quit outside of available services each year[46]. In addition, use of SCS was impacted during the pandemic, with almost 1,000 less smokers accessing services in 2020, bringing service figures down for the first time in 6 years[47]. In light of this, we highlight the need to reinforce and improve smoking cessation services in Wales.

It would be beneficial to assess how this body of work would feed into other areas of the TCDP, such as the Help Me Quit Hospital Model and reducing inequalities. Within this scope, we highlight the

---

[40] Stephens WE. Comparing the cancer potencies of emissions from vapourised nicotine products including e-cigarettes with those of tobacco smoke 2017
[41] Public Health England. Evidence review of e-cigarettes and heated tobacco products 2018: executive summary 2018
[42] NSW. National Survey for Wales 2018-19: adult smoking and e-cigarette use 2018
[43] Hartmann-Boyce J, McRobbie H, Butler AR, Lindson N, et al,. Electronic cigarettes for smoking cessation. Cochrane Database of Systematic 2021
[44] NICE Recommendations on treating tobacco dependence | Tobacco: preventing uptake, promoting quitting and treating dependence | Guidance | NICE 2021
[45] NSW. National Survey for Wales 2018-19: adult smoking and e-cigarette use 2018
[46] Welsh Government. Welsh resident smokers who made a quit attempt via NHS smoking cessation services, by local health board and cumulative quarters within a financial year 2021
[47] Welsh Government. Welsh resident smokers who made a quit attempt via NHS smoking cessation services, by local health board and cumulative quarters within a financial year 2020

importance of scoping the service needs of priority groups, to ensure that this body of work is as accessible and inclusive as possible.

ASH Wales and Respiratory Innovation Wales (RIW) carried out research to assess the appetite for digital solutions in Wales[48]. A series of questionnaires were designed by Community Pharmacy Wales, RIW and Welsh health care professionals. Data was obtained from smokers, ex-smokers, health care professionals and additional stakeholders. The results are as follows:

- 80% of smokers said they would like a personalised quit plan.
- 84% of smokers said they would be happy for their personal assessment to be shared with their quit smoking adviser.
- 72% of smokers said they would or might use a digital system to book an SCS appointment.
- 84% of smokers thought most of the suggested features were useful.

A questionnaire was tailored for stakeholders and SCS providers. Within this, all SCS stakeholders believed an online system would or may be helpful. Comments were also invited and echoed many of the digital features smokers found useful. These included:

- A service to fit around the service users
- Additional support packages i.e., mental health.
- Incentivisation programmes.
- Advice on e-cigarettes.

It is important to note that age was thought to play a considerable factor within findings, as a third of smokers said they would not use an online system to book SCS appointments. In light of this, digital solutions should not be the sole method of SCS in Wales. Despite this, the survey showed good acceptability for proposals to adopt digital solutions from smokers, stakeholders and service providers in Wales.

ASH Wales strongly supports this action with this priority action area, as there is a clear appetite for a strengthened, digitalised and more accessible SCS in Wales.

ASH Wales recommends:

- Work to drive forward digital solutions for smokers is undertaken as a priority in the 2022-24 timeframe.
- Solutions work in conjunction with current smoking cessation programmes.
- Digital methods to promote awareness and access to smoking cessation services.
- Research into which solutions work best for certain groups, with a focus on priority groups.
- A multi-disciplinary task and finish group with robust WG backing funding and two-year timeline.

Priority action area 3: Priority groups

ASH Wales supports all the actions within priority action area 3.

ASH Wales highlights the importance of drawing upon the current evidence-base for this area, and funding additional research where gaps exist. We support and recommend the following:

[48] ASH Wales. Digital Smoking Platform Report 2019

i.) Smoke-free pregnancies

Financial Incentives for pregnant smokers

ASH Wales has recently campaigned for financial incentives for pregnant smokers to be utilised within SCS in Wales[49]. This is due to an established evidence base that demonstrates that this method is highly effective.

The harms of smoking during pregnancy are well documented, which includes complications within pregnancy, stillbirths, neonatal death and serious long-term health implications for both mothers and babies[50]. Studies have also shown that children growing up in a household where their mother smokes are over two times more likely to smoke in later life, reinforcing existing inequalities and cycles of disadvantage[51]. Thus, the cross-generational nature of smoking prevalence within this area should not be overlooked and the actions to address this issue need to be proportionate.

In Wales, 17% of women were recorded as smokers at their initial assessment in 2020, a 1%-point increase from the previous year, with young mothers aged between 16-19 marking the highest smoking prevalence (35% of all smoking pregnancies)[52]. Compared to the previous year, smoking prevalence has risen by 5 percentage points in groups aged 16-19 and 40-44[53]. To help aid this area of the TCDP, ASH Wales points to the evidence-base below.

In pregnancy, financial incentives have been shown to be one of the most effective ways of helping pregnant women to quit. A Cochrane Review, conducted in 2019, has confirmed the finding that incentives are an effective way of supporting pregnant women to quit smoking during pregnancy and remain smoke-free post-partum[54]. The review found that women receiving incentives were more than twice as likely to quit compared to those in non-incentives groups[55]. In addition to this, incentives have been trialled in UK clinical settings. Notably in NHS Glasgow & Clyde, which found the following[56]:

- Significantly more smokers in the incentives group than control group stopped smoking: (22.5%) versus (8.6%).

Within this consideration it is important to highlight the cost effectiveness of such an approach. A 2009 Cochrane Review into interventions to support smoking cessation in pregnancy, concluded that the societal benefits from a range of interventions – including incentives – could be in excess of £500 million per annum in the UK. The 2013 update of this review concluded that incentive schemes deliver a return on investment of £4 for every £1 invested[57].

Surveys have shown that public approval for such schemes increases when information is provided on the effectiveness of such an approach[58] [59]. Public approval is thought to be a hindering factor

---

[49]ASH Wales. Action on Smoking and Health -ASH Wales calls for financial incentives and additional support to stop pregnant women from smoking 2021
[50] Mund M, Louwen F, Klingelhoefer D, Gerber A. Smoking and Pregnancy — A Review on the First Major Environmental Risk Factor of the Unborn 2013
[51] Leonardi-Be, J et al., Exposure to Parental and Sibling Smoking and the Risk of Smoking Uptake in Childhood and Adolescence: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. 2011
[52] Welsh Government. Maternity and birth statistics: 2020 | GOV.WALES 2021
[53] Welsh Government. Maternity and birth statistics: 2020 | GOV.WALES 2021
[54] Notley C, Gentry S, Livingstone-Banks J, Bauld L, Perera R, Hartmann-Boyce J . Incentives for smoking cessation (Cochrane Review)2019
[55] Notley C, Gentry S, Livingstone-Banks J, Bauld L, Perera R, Hartmann-Boyce J . Incentives for smoking cessation (Cochrane Review) 2019
[56] Tappin D, Bauld L, Purves D, Boyd K, Sinclair L, MacAskill S, et al. Financial incentives for smoking cessation in pregnancy: randomised controlled trial | The BMJ; 350: h134. 2015
[57] Chamberlain C, O'Mara-Eves A , Oliver S , Caird J, Perlen S, Eades S, Thomas J. Psychosocial interventions for supporting women to stop smoking in pregancy 2013
[58] ASH/YouGov. Smokefree GB Survey 2018
[59] Smoking in Pregnancy Challenge Group. Evidence into Practice: Supporting smokefree pregnancies 2019

within this area, thus clear messaging highlighting the benefits of such an approach should be established.

In light of the above, ASH Wales believes it is time for practice to reflect evidence within this area.

ASH Wales Recommends:

- Incentive schemes to be employed to increase smoke-free pregnancies in Wales.
- Such schemes to be offered alongside additional evidence-based practices (i.e behavioural support).
- Incentive schemes to be framed with messaging highlighting the evidence and benefits of such an approach.
- Targeted support in areas where maternal smoking prevalence is highest in Wales.

CO screening for pregnant smokers

Within this workstream, we recommend that carbon monoxide screening is embedded within maternity services in Wales, as standard practice. Evidence suggests that routine CO monitoring of smokers increase smokers' motivation to stop smoking and improves the effect of quit advice in the general population[60] [61]. CO monitoring provides smokers with visible proof of the harm caused by smoking, and it gives people a practical measurement of their smoking status with which to chart their progress after they stop smoking. In addition, CO monitoring can be used as a diagnostic tool used to assess a women's exposure to CO and identify a way of managing that risk - usually through referrals to SCS[62].

ASH Wales recommendation:

- CO screening offered within all maternity services in Wales.
- Screening to be offered with referrals to SCS support.

A standardised SCS for pregnant smokers across Wales

Working with our partners, it has been voiced that smoking cessation services for pregnant smokers can vary considerable between health boards. In light of this, it would be beneficial to secure a standardised level of SCS, so that pregnant smokers across Wales can access the same level of support and service.

ASH Wales recommendation:

- Standardised level of SCS for pregnant smokers across Wales.

ii.) Financial incentives for additional priority groups

Within actions outlined in this priority area, it would be beneficial to explore how financial incentives could be used amongst additional priority groups. In light of this, we highlight the following research.

The Cochrane Library provides a comprehensive review of the effectiveness of different behavioural interventions for smoking cessation [63]. This meta-review covers 312 randomised controlled trials

[60] Goldstein A O, Gans S P, Ripley-Moffitt C, Kotsen C, Bars M. Use of Expired Air Carbon Monoxide Testing in Clinical Tobacco Treatment Settings Feb 1;153(2):554-62. 2018

[61] Shahab L., West R., McNeill A. A randomized, controlled trial of adding expired carbon monoxide feedback to brief stop smoking advice: evaluation of cognitive and behavioral effects 2011

[62] Smoking in Pregnancy Challenge Group Evidence into Practice:CO monitoring and data collection throughout pregnancy 2021

[63] Hartmann-Boyce J, Livingstone-Banks J, Ordóñez-Mena J. Behavioural interventions for smoking cessation: an overview and network meta-analysis 2021

(115 in healthcare settings, 195 in community settings), representing 250,563 participants. The review found that behavioural interventions for smoking cessation were found to increase quit rates, but that their effectiveness varies depending on the characteristics of support provided.

A significant finding of the review showed high certainty evidence that the inclusion of financial incentives in a programme supporting smokers to quit can increase the success of smoking cessation by 46%, compared to no support[64]. This finding is significant, given that the focus of incentive schemes has largely been centred around smoke-free pregnancies in UK, without exploring benefits outside of this group.

The review's findings provide no direct guidelines for choosing a particular stop smoking service model over another. However, the findings show that financial incentives should be considered for additional groups. ASH Wales recommends that this area should be explored, particularly for high smoking prevalence groups outlined within this action area.

Recommendation:

- Financial incentives to be explored for additional priority groups.

iii.) Mental Health

It is estimated that smoking rates among people living with mental health conditions stands at 33% in Wales[65]. Smoking is a major contributory factor to reduced life expectancy and ill health, with research showing, for instance, that 53% of those with schizophrenia die from smoking-related diseases[66]. In addition to this, it is thought that those living with a mental health condition increases the likelihood of being economically disadvantaged, with high unemployment rates evident in this group, which is expected to rise due to the pandemic [67] [68]. Smoking compounds economic disparities, particularly amongst poorer smokers living with mental health conditions in the UK[69].

In light of this, we welcome the inclusion of this area within the TCDP, particularly 'reviewing evidence and data around smoking cessation support for these priority groups'[70]. As the TCDP highlights, despite high prevalence of smoking amongst people with mental health conditions, only a minority of people receive effective smoking cessation interventions in Wales.

ASH Wales recommends:

- Mental health specialists are represented in the implementation groups for the TCAP.
- A dataset to review the impact of cessation support for individuals living with mental health conditions.
- Set interim targets for this priority group, within later editions of the TCDP.
- Ensure that the 'Help Me Quit Hospital Model' systematically identifies all smokers in this group and offers cessation support within an 'opt-out model'.
- Tailoring the above to meet the needs of this priority group.
- Mandatory training for mental health practitioners to offer brief intervention support and advice for referrals to SCS.

---

[64] ASH UK .The Cochrane Review of behavioural interventions for smoking cessation, explained 2021
[65]ASH Wales . Smoking Cessation and Mental Health 2017
[66] Callaghan RC, Veldhuizen S, Jeysingh T, et al. Patterns of tobacco-related mortality among individuals diagnosed with schizophrenia, bipolar disorder, or depression 2014
[67] Luciano A, Meara E . The employment status of people with mental illness: National survey data from 2009 and 2010. 65(10): 1201–1209. 2014
[68] NHS Wales. Economic Consequences of COVID-19 Pandemic Outbreak on Health Indicators and Health Service Use in Wales 2020
[69]ASH UK, PHE. Mental health, smoking and poverty in the UK:A report commissioned by ASH and PHE 2016
[70] Welsh Government. A SMOKE-FREE WALES - Our Long Term Tobacci Control Strategy for Wales 2021

- Specifically address smoking within the national mental health strategy and delivery plan for Wales[71].

A systematic review measuring changes in mental health following smoking cessation found that quitting smoking was associated with reduced depression, anxiety and stress, and improved positive mood and quality of life, compared with those who continued to smoke[72]. Smoking cessation has also been linked to a reduction in medication dosage, as tobacco smoke has been seen to interact with certain psychiatric medications, which render higher doses [73] [74]. Despite the common misconception, smoking does not reduce anxiety or deal with its underlying causes[75].In light of this, ASH Wales recommends that the above body of work is reinforced with:

- Effective messaging highlighting the benefits of smoking cessation for those living with mental health conditions.

iv.) Social Housing

According to ASH Wales YouGov survey (2018), smoking prevalence among Welsh social housing tenants is around double the average figure across all surveyed respondents (24%>13%)[76]. Furthermore, social housing tenants were twice as likely as residents in other housing tenures to be exposed to second-hand smoke (SHS) in their own home from someone who lives there, by a neighbour and in the communal areas of the building[77]. In light of this, this body of work not only holds the capacity to address high prevalence rates among social housing tenants but would also help reduce the harms ensued through SHS.

On a UK wide level, many local authorities and health care providers provide smoking cessation programmes to help address this area of high smoking prevalence. Notably, the Greater Manchester Health and Social Care partnership, which funded a 3-month e-cigarette pilot, delivered by the local housing association Salix Homes and the Salford stop smoking service[78]. At the end of the pilot, 63% of participants had quit smoking, which was considered a success due to high participation, with over 1000 smokers receiving support.

WG action to support smoke-free housing association tenancy agreements would be beneficial within this area.

ASH Wales recommends:

- Social Housing specialists are represented in the implementation groups for the TCDP.
- Fund social housing providers to run smoking cessation programmes for their tenants in collaboration with community pharmacy, or local Stop Smoking Services.
- Train professionals working in social housing in offering brief advice to quit.
- Include an offer of e-cigarette starter kits in conjunction with SCS support.
- Include targets on smoking cessation and training in WG funding for housing associations, and ensure training is provided to other professionals visiting tenants in housing association settings.
- WG to support smoke-free housing association tenancy agreements in Wales.

---

[71] Welsh Government . Review of the together for mental health delivery plan 2020
[72] Taylor G, et al. Change in mental health after smoking cessation: systematic review and meta-analysis. BMJ 348: g1151 2014
[73] WHO . Management of physical health conditions in adults with severe mental disorders. WHO guidelines 2018
[74] Taylor D, Paton C, Kapur S. Maudsley. Prescribing Guidelines. 11th Ed. Informa Healthcare 2012
[75] Picciotto MR, Brunzell DH, Caldarone BJ. Effect of nicotine and nicotinic receptors on anxiety and depression - PubMed 13: 1097-1106. 2002
[76] ASH Wales. Second-hand smoke exposure and smoking 2018
[77] ASH Wales. Second-hand smoke exposure and smoking 2018
[78] ASH UK. Its_time_to_talk_about_smoking_case_studies 2019

ASH Wales believes this multi-agency approach could considerably curtail smoking prevalence within this priority group, and would cohere to the 'whole systems' approach of the strategy.

v.) Children and Young People

In Wales 8% of 15 to 16-year-olds smoke on a regular basis – a figure that has not fallen since 2013[79]. According to SHRN, a significantly greater proportion of less affluent young people report to have ever smoked in Wales[80]. In addition, there has been a significant recent increase in the proportion of 11–16-year-olds who used cannabis monthly in Wales (4.3% in 2019 compared to 2.7% in 2013)[81]. In light of the above, we support work in this area, and recommend the following:

- Specialists within this field are represented in the implementation groups for the TCDP.
- A cross governmental approach to address the co-use of tobacco and cannabis, given the strong links between the two substances.
- A national education programme to be delivered in all secondary schools highlighting the health impacts of smoking.
- A tailored intervention and support programme for Pupil Referral Units and further education colleges in Wales.
- Increased targeted support including cessation support in areas with higher smoking prevalence.
- The development of innovation digital solutions to raise awareness of the harms of smoking among children and young people.

Looked after children

Within this work stream, it would be beneficial to consider how actions could be made accessible to children and young people living in care. Research conducted by Cardiff University in 2017 found that children in the Welsh foster care system are eight times more likely to smoke, compared to children not in care[82]. This level of smoking is consistent with the multiple disadvantages that often characterise looked-after children living within the UK[83].

ASH Wales recommends:

- Funding research to establish what interventions and SCS work for looked-after children and young people.
- Establishing a data set to monitor smoking prevalence within this group.
- Working with local authorities and third-sector organisations to deliver evidence-based training to care-providers. Notably the Fostering Network/ASH Wales.
- To ensure all local authorities and fostering and adoption service providers in Wales have an explicit foster care and adoption smoking policy. This policy should promote non-smoking for all foster carers and adoptive parents. It should support carers to give up smoking and at the very least promote smokefree homes, while balancing the risk of exposure against the benefit of appropriate care[84].

---

[79] SHRN Youth_smoking_and_vaping_in_Wales 2020
[80] SHRN Youth_smoking_and_vaping_in_Wales 2020
[81] SHRN Trends-in-youth-smoking-cannabis-use-and-their-association. 2020
[82] Long S, et al., Comparison of substance use, subjective well-being and interpersonal relationships among young people in foster care and private households: a cross sectional analysis of the School Health Research Network survey in Wales 2017
[83] Department for Education and Department for Health. Promoting the health and well-being of looked-after children: Statutory guidance for local authorities, clinical commissioning groups and NHS England 2015
[84] ASH UK & The Fostering Network. Joint Briefing on Foster Care, Adoption and Smoking 2016

vi) Supporting people from socio-economically deprived backgrounds

Statistics show that people from socio-economically deprived areas are more likely to smoke, and more likely to smoke *more* than their more affluent counterparts[85] [86]. Research conducted by ASH has estimated that 28% of those living in poverty in the UK could be lifted out of poverty if they stopped smoking[87]. In addition to economic disadvantages, higher smoking prevalence within this group translates to higher rates of smoking-related health implications[88]. Furthermore, data from England indicates that smokers within this group exhibit less quit rates, when compared to more affluent counterparts[89]. In light of this, we view this area of the TCDP of critical importance.

A systematic review conducted by CRUK has highlighted that there is a surprising lack of research within this area[90]. However, the review suggests that a tailored approach to smoking cessation services can increase access to, and uptake for smokers from lower socio-economic backgrounds.

The review highlights several studies with promising findings that show a tailored approach can have an impact via; tailored GP invitation letters, accessible messaging, outreach workers and mobile SCS. The review also marks that progress in this area is likely to be achieved when national SCS targets are created and include measurable equity impact-which ensures that all groups access support. A prime example of this is Scotland, which cemented a national SCS equity-based target in 2011 and had success in combating health inequalities by helping more smokers from lower socio-economic groups to quit[91].

The CRUK research highlights that there is considerable evidence to suggest that lower success quit rates amongst disadvantaged smokers can be balanced out by ensuring that these groups have the best possible access to cessation services, which can lead to more frequent use of these services. Thus, there is a need to strengthen referral and treatment pathways to ensure systems are properly geared for this task in Wales.

ASH Wales recommends:

- Funding research into which tailored SCS best supports smokers from socio-economically deprived groups.
- Adapting national smoking cessation service data to gather information on socio-economic status.
- A commitment to national SCS targets, which include measurable equity impact (to ensure deliberate targeting of lower socio-economic groups).

vii) LGBT Community

On a UK wide level, smoking rates are significantly higher within the LGBT community[92]. To our knowledge, there is not a data set marking smoking prevalence within the adult LGBT population in

---

[85] NSW. National Survey for Wales 2018-19: adult smoking and e-cigarette use 2019
[86] ASH Wales. Inequalities Briefing Paper 2019
[87] ASH UK . New figures show each local authority how many people could be lifted out of poverty if they quit smoking 2015
[88] Gruer L, Hart C, Gordon D, Watt G. Effect of tobacco smoking on survival of men and women by social position: a 28 year cohort study BMJ 2009
[89] ASH UK . Health Inequalities Paper2019
[90] Smith.C, Hill.S, Amos A. Stop Smoking Inequalities: A systematic review of socioeconomic inequalities in experiences of smoking cessation interventions in the UK. Cancer Research UK. 2018
[91] Smith.C, Hill.S, Amos A Stop Smoking Inequalities: A systematic review of socioeconomic inequalities in experiences of smoking cessation interventions in the UK. Cancer Research UK. 2018
[92] Hudson-Sharp N, Metcalf H. Inequality among lesbian, gay bisexual and transgender groups in the UK: a review of evidence 2016

Wales. To steer action and address health inequalities within the LGBT subgroup, ASH Wales recommends:

- Stapling a dataset to assess smoking prevalence within the adult LGBT population in Wales, this could be part of data retrieved through cessation services.
- Working with services and third-sector organisations which hold an established reach into the LGBT community
- Explore how services that work specifically with members of the LGBT community can offer VBA to stop smoking.
- Ensure that messaging is inclusive and circulated amongst LGBT community spaces (as outlined in action 4).

The Welsh Government has recently filmed interviews with representatives of the LGBT community, to tailor messaging. ASH Wales supports this action and believes this will aid reach and inclusivity.

viii) Ethnic Minority Groups

Smoking remains the most common form of tobacco used by all communities in the UK[93]. However, the way people from different ethnic backgrounds use tobacco can vary. Some ethnic minorities are substantially more likely to use smokeless tobacco (in particular, South Asian Britons) and shisha pipes (in particular, Middle Eastern and South Asian Britons)[94]. Thus, we are pleased the TCDP recognises these differences in tobacco use and has suggested a tailored approach to support.

ASH Wales supports all the actions outlined in priority action 3, in context to supporting ethnic minority groups. We also recommend:

- Establishing a dataset to measure the impact of actions geared towards ethnic minority groups.
- Working with services and third-sector organisations which hold an established reach into the ethnic minority groups in Wales
- Ensure services that specifically work with ethnic minority groups can offer VBA to stop smoking.
- Ensure that messaging is inclusive and tailored (as outlined in action 4).

ix.) People in Routine and Manual Occupations

Market research into people within the R&M group suggests that smoking is often characterised by; routine, social norms, identity and feelings of being daunted by the prospect of quitting[95]. The UK Government's Department of Health National Support Team issued a paper in 2009 centred on tackling health inequalities within this group[96]. The paper outlines key recommendations which reflect many of the actions outlined in the TCDP. ASH Wales has included additional recommendations outlined in the paper below:

- Stop smoking services target R&M smokers utilising local public health data and social marketing insights.

[93] ASH UK. Factsheet_Ethnic-Minorities 2019
[94] ASH UK. Factsheet_Ethnic-Minorities 2019
[95] Department of Health. Tackling health inequalities: Targeting routine and manual smokers in support of the public service agreement smoking prevalence and health inequality targets, 2009
[96] Department of Health. Tackling health inequalities: Targeting routine and manual smokers in support of the public service agreement smoking prevalence and health inequality targets, 2009

- As community is important to R&M smokers, third sector community organisations are able to provide local insights to stop smoking service providers and commissioners. They can also, following training, provide community-based stop smoking advice and support through contractual arrangements with specialist provider stop smoking services, channelling R&M smokers to the specialist service.

Priority Action area 4: Tackle illegal tobacco and support the tobacco control legal framework

ASH Wales strongly supports all the actions within priority action area 4.

Illegal Tobacco

Illegal tobacco is a serious problem in Wales; it undermines all of our tobacco controls and makes it easier for children to access tobacco. It is estimated that one million illegal cigarettes are smoked each day in Wales[97].

ASH Wales and partners have long campaigned for dedicated enforcement and marketing campaign to tackle the illegal tobacco market in Wales.

In 2021 HMRC funded a national enforcement campaign, Operation CeCe, which is run by trading standards teams in Wales. In 2021 alone, an estimated 2.84 million cigarettes and 404kg pouches of hand-rolling tobacco were seized from the Welsh illegal market[98].

The Welsh Government have recently funded a national marketing campaign aimed at reducing the demand and supply of illegal tobacco. Key elements of the campaign include:

- A dedicated reporting portal for illegal tobacco
- A website hosting the campaign assets
- A suite of resources for stakeholders
- A targeted mass media campaign including digital assets, radio adverts, posters and beer mats.
- All Wales police training on the impact of illegal tobacco and how to report it.
- A NEMS survey of adults and young people and their access and attitudes to illegal tobacco

The results of these campaigns will; build essential partnerships in the fight against illegal tobacco, assist in the creation of tailored messaging for priority groups, provide national data on the scale of the problem in Wales. In addition, an upcoming NEMS survey will garner national data from young smokers, which will highlight access to the illegal tobacco market in Wales.

To continue progress within this workstream, ASH Wales recommends:

- WG commit to funding the illegal tobacco marketing campaign in Wales
- WG to encourage a multi-agency approach to the illegal tobacco landscape, specifically utilising local authorities and the police
- WG commit to funding a biennial NEMS survey for young people and adults
- Local Authorities across Wales are tasked with producing Annual Tobacco Control Surveys including data relating to underage sales and other enforcement activity

---

[97] Stat based off last ASH Wales NEMS Survey 2015.
[98] HMRC. Stats obtained from HMRC by ASH Wales in January 2022.

Tobacco control legal framework

In addition to the above, ASH Wales welcomes the upcoming WG review of key tobacco legislation, specifically the implementation of the Tobacco Products and Security measure (Tobacco Products Duty Act 1979). The planned review would seek to give HMRC regulatory powers to introduce tougher and more visible street-level sanctions to tackle tobacco duty evasion.

Within this workstream, EOIDs would enhance the regulatory framework, and help strengthen sanctions on this front in Wales.

ASH Wales recommends that:

Welsh Government ensure Welsh Trading Standards teams;

- Have access (directly or through a real-time portal with HMRC) to a database to clarify the EOID status of a trader.
- Have access to hand-held technologies to distinguish between illegal tobacco and legal tobacco (illegal sellers can mix non-compliant and compliant stock which can be a deterrent to enforcement activity).
- Have the power to deactivate EOID's for repeat non-compliance to the law. We support a permanent deactivation of the EOID following a second offence of selling tobacco illegally.

ASH Wales responded to the consultation on HMRC's proposed sanctions to tackle tobacco duty evasion last year[99].

i.) Retail Register

The Public Health (Wales) Act 2017 includes provisions which may be used as part of our tobacco control legal framework in Wales. This includes:

- Establishing a register of retailers of tobacco and nicotine products
- The use of restricted premises orders and restricted sale orders relating to the sale of tobacco and nicotine products for those who have been convicted of tobacco or nicotine offences
- Restrictions on remote sales of tobacco and nicotine products to those over the age of 18 years

Developments for the proposed retail register has been underway since 2015, with the last TCP marking an ongoing review of evidence of 'the Public Health (Wales) Act 2017 to examine the density of tobacco retailers'[100]. A tobacco retail register for Wales has yet to be implemented. ASH Wales believes progress has been halted over concerns the register may duplicate elements of the proposed track and trace system, however the scope of the system is currently uncertain and data sharing is limited. Therefore, ASH Wales believes a retail register would still be of significant benefit to Wales.

ASH Wales recommends:

- The full implementation of the section 2 of the Public Health (Wales) Act 2017 within the 2022-24 framework to include;
    - A register of retailers of tobacco and nicotine products

[99] ASH Wales. Sanctions to tackle tobacco duty evasion 2021
[100] Welsh Government. tobacco-control-delivery-plan-for-wales-2017-to-2020. 2017

- The use of restricted premises orders and restricted sale orders relating to the sale of tobacco and nicotine products for those who have been convicted of tobacco or nicotine offences
- Restrictions on remote sales of tobacco and nicotine products to those over the age of 18 years.

ii.) Track & Trace System

ASH Wales fully supports the implementation of the UK's Track and Trace system. ASH Wales recommends that data from this system is aggregated down to provide figures for Wales, with location specific information for local authorities. This information needs to be collected on at least an annual basis.

We would also call for information on non-compliance and enforcement activity to be made available to Welsh Government on a quarterly basis.

In addition, we also support the implementation of a public health licensing scheme in place of a retail register, if sanctions and monitoring are more robust via this scheme.

Recommendations:

- Annual figures for retailers and whole sellers for local authority across Wales
- Quarterly information on non-compliance and enforcement activity
- Public health licensing scheme to replace Wales' tobacco retail register, if sanctions and monitoring are more robust via this scheme.

Priority Action area 5: Working across the UK

ASH Wales supports all the actions within priority action area 5.

Within this area, we highlight the importance of cross Government working for the Age of Sale, and a proposed 'Polluter Pays' Tobacco Levy.

Increasing the Age for Sale for tobacco from 18 to 21

Welsh Government, currently, does not have the power to independently change the age of sale of tobacco products. However, ASH Wales welcomes the commitment within the TCDP to work across the UK on non-devolved issues including the age of sale. We believe this should be a priority consideration, given the impact the age of sale holds on smoking prevalence[101] .

Wales cannot currently raise the age of sale for tobacco products unless this is taken forward in Westminster. Therefore we urge Welsh Government to work closely with the UK Government to:

- Urge DHSC to consult on raising the age of sale from 18 to 21
- Ensure Welsh interests are represented at a UK level
- Ensure Welsh Ministers are appraised of the wide-reaching implications of raising the age of sale
- Monitoring systems are in place to assess the impact

If the age of sale were raised, we urge Welsh Government to be prepared to implement the legislation in a timely manner across Wales.

[101] ASH UK Rationale for Raising the Age of Sale 2021

Examined on its own merits, it is proportionate to increase the age of sale to 21 due to the unique harm caused by smoking. Tobacco is the only legal consumer product that when used as intended kills half of all its long-term users. Smoking-related diseases kill over 5,000 people in Wales each year [102] [103]. Consequently, smoking requires a unique regulatory response to minimise the burden of preventable death and disease it inflicts on society. Smoking is addictive and uniquely harmful and increasing the age of sale would reduce uptake and save thousands of lives.

ASH Wales' latest YouGov survey shows that only 8% of Welsh smokers tried their first cigarette after the age of 21, meanwhile, 76% of adult smokers in Wales had their first cigarette before the age of 18[104]. It is therefore vital that Wales supports measures to make tobacco products less available to young people.

In December 2019 the US Government instituted 21 years as the minimum age of sale by federal law. Evidence from the US shows raising the age of sale from 18 to 21 reduced smoking prevalence in that age group by at least 30%[105] [106]. This is very similar to the impact when the age of sale in England was increased from 16 to 18 in 2007. This led to a reduction of 30% in smoking prevalence in people aged 16 and 17 years, partly by reducing uptake and partly by promoting cessation, which had a sustained impact [107] [108] [109].

In Wales, 8% of 15–16-year-olds still smoke on a regular basis – a figure that has not fallen since 2013[110] [111]. In a report centred on raising the age of sale to 21 in the US, the IoM concluded that "the largest proportionate reduction in the initiation of tobacco use will likely occur among adolescents 15 to 17 years old"[112].

The rationale for the US legislation was that smoking is a contagious practice, and that an age increase would protect younger children from exposure and influence of older youth who smoke. If the age of sale were raised in Wales, its scope to impact younger age groups should not be overlooked.

A recent English study concluded that increasing the age of sale of cigarettes to 21 years in England would target approximately 364 000 lower dependent smokers from more disadvantaged backgrounds, aged 18–20[113]. In light of this, such legislation would aid the reducing inequalities theme within the strategy.

---

[102] ONS. Adult smoking habits in the UK :2019. 2020
[103] Public Health Wales. Smoking in Wales 2018
[104] ASH Wales .YouGov Survey 2021 2021
[105] Friedman AS, Buckell J, Sindelar JL. Tobacco-21 laws and young adult smoking: quasi-experimental evidence 2019
[106] Fidler JA, West R. Changes in smoking prevalence in 16-17-year-old versus older adults following a rise in legal age of sale: findings from an English population study 2010
[107] ASH UK Rationale for Raising the Age of Sale 2021
[108] Fidler JA, West R. Changes in smoking prevalence in 16-17-year-old versus older adults following a rise in legal age of sale: findings from an English population study 2010
[109] Beard E, Brown J, Jackson S, West R, Anderson W, Arnott D, Shahab L. Long-term evaluation of the rise in legal age-of-sale of cigarettes from 16 to 18 in England: a trend analysis 2020
[110] SHRN. SHRN Survey 2019/2020 2021
[111] ASH Wales Smoking & Young People - Action on Smoking and Health (ash.wales) 2022
[112] Institute of Medicine, Public Health Implications of Raising the Minimum Age of Legal Access to Tobacco Products, 2015
[113] Beard E, Brown J, Jackson SE, West R, Anderson W, Arnott D, Shahab L. Who would be targeted by increasing the legal age of sale of cigarettes from 18 to 21? A cross-sectional study exploring the number and characteristics of smokers in England. 2021

It is estimated that of every three young smokers, only one will quit, and one of those remaining smokers will die from tobacco-related causes[114]. Early smoking uptake is associated with subsequent heavier smoking, higher levels of dependency, and higher mortality[115].

For Wales to reach its ambition of a smokefree target by 2030, there needs to be a significant step-change in actions to prevent the uptake of youth smoking. Raising the age of sale has considerable scope to reduce youth smoking prevalence and inequalities.

Public Support: The latest ASH Wales YouGov survey on social attitudes towards tobacco control found 63% support raising the age of sale from 18 to 21 in Wales, while only 16% oppose[116].

ASH Wales supports Priority Action Area 5, and WG's commitment to working with other UK Governments on non-devolved tobacco control issues such as the Age of Sale. ASH Wales believes this area will have a considerable impact on a critical age group with regards to smoking uptake in Wales.

Polluter Pays Levy

Smoking imposes substantial costs on the National Health Service in Wales (estimated at £302 million per year) as well as a range of other costs to public finances[117]. A tobacco levy imposed on the tobacco industry would garner considerable funds for Wales to enact the TCDP actions and ambitions presented in this document. A levy would work on the principle that the polluter pays for the costs it ensues on society. This mechanism holds the following:

- A levy for a specific amount from the tobacco industry provides a certain revenue stream, which makes it easier to ensure that tobacco control interventions are fully and reliably funded. By contrast, an increase in tobacco excise duties (for example) will raise a greater or smaller amount of revenue depending on the elasticity of demand for tobacco products[118].

- It is estimated that 90% of the UK's tobacco market is controlled by just four global manufacturers, who garner UK profits of £900M per annum[119]. Based on current operating profit for the UK's largest tobacco manufacturers of £900M, (with an average profit margin just under 50%), it is estimated that a tobacco levy could raise funds in the region of £700M per annum. ASH UK estimates that around £266M per annum is required to fund a comprehensive tobacco control programme in England to realise a Smoke-free 2030, with an additional £49 million on a per capita basis for other UK nations[120].

At the time of writing, a polluter pays levy is being debated as part of the Health and Care Bill, within the House of Lords. If this amendment were passed, it would increase pressure on the UK Government to consult on a statutory scheme. Within this, we urge the WG to:

- Respond positively to any consultation process, in favour of a polluter pays levy.

---

[114] U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. The Health Consequences of Smoking: 50 Years of Progress. A Report of the Surgeon General 2014
[115] Leonardi-Bee J, Jere M, Britton J. Exposure to parental and sibling smoking and the risk of smoking uptake in childhood and adolescence: a systematic review and meta-analysis 2011
[116] ASH Wales .YouGov Survey 2021 2021
[117] NHS Wales. Smoking (quitting) with Help me Quit 2021
[118] ASH UK, LandmanEconomics_Impact-of-levy-on-Public-Finances 2019
[119] Featherstone HJ . Establishing a Smoke-free 2030 Fund . 2021
[120] Featherstone HJ . Establishing a Smoke-free 2030 Fund . 2021

- Ensure that monies obtained from a statutory scheme would be divided fairly to the devolved nations. For example, fair allocation could be based off the amount of tobacco sold in each nation.

Question 8

Do you think there are any key actions not captured in the priority action areas? If so, what would they be?

Please provide additional comments

Targeted and consistent media campaigns

Mass media campaigns have been a key component of the UK's tobacco control strategy since the early 2000s, and there is strong evidence that tobacco control MMCs can increase adult smoking cessation and reduce smoking uptake[121] [122] [123]. Systematic reviews of economic evaluations of past campaigns have found MMC's to be cost effective[124], however, campaigns need to have sufficient intensity and be sustained in order to have a meaningful effect[125]. For effective MMC's, see the Royal College of Physicians *Nicotine Without Smoke* report[126], and its review on effective levels of gross rating points (MMC exposure).

England's 2012 Stoptober campaign, which used both new and traditional media, was estimated to have generated 350,000 quit attempts and almost 9,000 permanent quitters in October 2012 (based off the conservative estimate that 2.5% of quit attempts would lead to permanent cessation) [127].

A 2016 regional mass media campaign conducted by Fresh North East and Smokefree Yorkshire and Humber illustrates the value of mass media in promoting quit attempts[128]. The campaign reached approximately 333,000 people via TV, radio, print and online. Of those who saw the campaign, it is estimated that 16% (around 55,300 people) cut down on their smoking. A further 8.4% (around 28,000 people) made a quit attempt as a result of the campaign, while 4% switched to electronic cigarettes[129].

The Royal College of Physicians highlights within it's *Nicotine without Smoke* report:
'*Over the period from 2002 to 2009, when adult smoking prevalence in Britain fell from 26% to 21%, an estimated 13.5% of this decline was attributable to the effect of MMCs'*[130] [131].

---

[121] Wakefield MA, Durkin S, Spittal MJ, et al., Impact of tobacco control policies and mass media campaigns on monthly adult smoking prevalence. 2008
[122] Durkin SJ, Biener L, Wakefield MA. Effects of different types of antismoking ads on reducing disparities in smoking cessation among socioeconomic groups. 2009
[123] National Cancer Institute. The role of the media in promoting and reducing tobacco use. NCI Tobacco Control Monograph Series. Bethesda, MD: US Department of Health and Human Services, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, 1998
[124] Atusingwize E, Lewis S, Langley T. Economic evaluations of tobacco control mass media campaigns: a systematic review 2015
[125] Durkin S, Wakefield M. Commentary on Sims et al. (2014) and Langley et al. (2014) Mass media campaigns require adequate and sustained funding to change population health behaviours. 2014
[126]RCP Nicotine without smoke: Tobacco harm reduction 2016
[127] Brown J, Kotz D, Michie S et al. How effective and cost-effective was the national mass media smoking cessation campaign 'Stoptober'? 2014
[128] ASH UK. Stoptober: ASH calls for more mass media campaigns to help smokers to quit 2016
[129] ASH UK. Stoptober: ASH calls for more mass media campaigns to help smokers to quit 2016
[130] RCP Nicotine without smoke: Tobacco harm reduction 2016
[131] Sims M, Salway R, Langley T et al. Effectiveness of tobacco control television advertising in changing tobacco use in England: a population-based cross-sectional study. 2014

In light of the above, ASH Wales recommends that MMC's are implemented throughout the TCDP. ASH Wales suggests that the following is adopted within this recommendation:

- A WG commitment to an annual mass media campaign.
- Maximise the opportunities from campaigns from other nations. ASH Wales believes that this would fit well within the Priority Action 5 of the plan: Working Across the UK.
- Seamless transition of those accessing SCS via Welsh media campaigns from other nations.

Allocated funding

It is widely recognised that to achieve the smokefree target of 5% by 2030 there needs to be a change of pace in measures to prevent smoking take-up and increase quit rates. This change of pace cannot be achieved without additional funding. The Healthy Weight Healthy Wales 2021-22 plan has allocated of funding of £6.5m to achieve the eight national priority areas[132]. This model of investment to achieve outcomes should undoubtedly be mirrored in Wales's TCDP.

ASH Wales recommends:

- Funding is allocated to support Wales' TCDP
- Additional funding is made available to support specific actions within the TCDP.

A ban on single use plastic cigarette filters

The European Union, through the Single Use Plastics Directive has recognised cigarette filters as one of the top 10 most common littered beach items[133]. This is consistent with findings from The Marine Conservation Society 2021 survey, which recorded 64.2 cigarette butts per 100 metres of Welsh coastline. The survey highlighted that Wales holds the highest number of littered butts in Great Britain in 2021[134].

The harms the plastic cigarette filters ensues on the environment is well established[135]. In light of the scale of this problem in Wales, we recommend the following:

- Regulatory action to ban single-use plastic cigarette filters in Wales.
- Raising awareness of the plastic content of cigarette filters, and their environmental harms.
- Any action within this area to exclude CRS action from the Tobacco Industry, to uphold our obligations to the WHO FCTC.

---

[132] Welsh Government . Healthy Weight: Healthy Wales delivery plan 2021 to 2022. 2021
[133]EU Commission. Single-use plastics 2019
[134] ASH Wales. Wales' Beaches Worst in Great Britain for Cigarette Butt Litter 2021
[135] Novotny TE, et al,. Cigarettes butts and the case for an environmental policy on hazardous cigarette waste. 2009

Question 9
Do the strategy and delivery plan align with other relevant areas of policy and practice?

[Partly]

Please explain why it aligns well or outline how it could be made better.

Declaration of Interest for Welsh Government TCDP Working Groups and Consultation Responses.

As a Party to the World Health Organisation Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC), the Welsh Government has an obligation to protect public health policy from the vested interests of the tobacco industry. To meet this obligation, ASH Wales suggests that a declaration of interest is required for future TCDP consultations, working groups and all areas concerning health policy. To safeguard the current Welsh TCDP, which has not issued a declaration of interest, we suggest analysing and separating the tobacco industry's responses to this consultation and treating them together as one industry response. This includes, but is not limited to, tobacco industry representatives, vested interest organisations or 'front groups'[136]. ASH Wales recommends WG utilises The Tobacco Control Research Group, who have a comprehensive directory of tobacco industry front groups and affiliates. Organisations and individuals can also be cross checked by a search on the University of Bath's Tobacco Tactics website[137], which for example lists PR agencies working for: known retail, licensed trade, think tanks and other organisations associated with tobacco industry arguments.

Recommendations:

- Declaration of interest required for future TCDP consultations, working groups and all areas concerning TC health policy.
- Separating the tobacco industry's responses to this consultation and treating them as one industry response.

<u>Implementation of WHO FCTC.</u>

ASH Wales calls for the Welsh Government's TCDP to be protected from the influence of the tobacco industry, in line with our commitments under the sole international public health treaty to which UK and EU are signatories (FCTC). As we tackle smoking prevalence in Wales, we must not forget that we aim to eradicate the tobacco industry's attempts to recruit the next generation of consumers. Thus, Wales' TCDP should be protected from industry interference.

Our recent work within the Senedd has shown that Wales is not exempt from tobacco industry interference[138]. ASH Wales have seen first-hand how the industry continues to attempt to reframe its image through transparent acts of corporate social responsibility[139]. This tactic is not new and is defined in the Conference of Parties guidelines on Art 5.3 as tobacco industry marketing[140]. CSR is a known strategy used to garner political support and influence. It is inappropriate in relation to a

[136] University of Bath .Astroturfing - TobaccoTactics 2022
[137] University of Bath .Home - TobaccoTactics 2022
[138] ASH Wales. SECOND OPEN LETTER TO MEMBERS OF THE SENEDD: JAPAN TOBACCO INTERNATIONAL 2021
[139] Hirschhorn N. Corporate social responsibility and the tobacco industry: hope or hype? | Tobacco Control (bmj.com) 2004
[140] WHO. Guidelines for implementation of Article 5.3 of the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control

lethal, often addictive product that cuts short the lives of half its consumers when used long term as the manufacturers intend.

Now more than ever, our pursuit of a smoke-free society must be shielded from the commercial interests of the tobacco industry. To ensure this, ASH Wales recommends that the FCTC obligations are written into the strategy, with particular reference to implementation of Article 5.3, which protects health policies from vested interests of the tobacco industry [141]. For policy guidance, ASH Wales refers to the UK Tobacco Interference Index policy recommendations, which includes proposals for devolved governments[142].

ASH Wales recommends that the Government adopts WHO FCTC guidelines within its 'whole system approach', creating a blanket policy that safeguards our road to a smoke-free society. WHO FCTC guidelines have been applied by the Scottish Government since its 2013 strategy, with a required declaration of interest for those taking part in Ministerial advisory groups, and respondents to consultations on tobacco health measures. The Scottish DOI requirement was recently updated in line with international good practice and applied to members of the working group convened to consider Scotland's next Tobacco Action Plan. WHO FCTC guidelines were also included in England's *Healthy Lives, Healthy People: A Tobacco Control Plan for England 2011*[143]. In addition, WHO FCTC obligations were included in *Towards a Smokefree Generation: A Tobacco Control Plan for England (2017),* which is referenced below:

> 'Finally, there is a fundamental and irreconcilable conflict between public health and the interests of the tobacco industry. Under Article 5.3, the WHO FCTC includes an obligation for all countries that have ratified the treaty to protect public health policies from the commercial and other vested interests of the tobacco industry. The government will continue to uphold its obligations under the WHO FCTC'[144].

ASH Wales recommends that Wales adopts the WHO FCTC within its own approach to tobacco control, to mirror or exceed policy safeguards evident in other UK nations.

Recommendations:

- WHO FCTC written into the strategy, with particular reference to Article 5.3, which protects health policies from the vested interest of the tobacco industry.
- Implement policy recommendations from the UK Tobacco Interference Index, which is tailored for devolved governments.
- Welsh Government's implementation of the FCTC to mirror or exceed that of other UK Governments.

---

[141] WHO. Guidelines for implementation of Article 5.3 of the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control

[142] Alebshehy R, et al., UKTI_Report_2021 2021

[143] Department of Health and Social Care. The tobacco control plan for England 2011

[144] Department of Health. Towards_a_Smoke_free_Generation_-_A_Tobacco_Control_Plan_for_England_2017-2022 2017

Question 10
We would like to know your views on the effects that *A Smoke-Free Wales: Our long term tobacco control strategy for Wales and Towards a Smoke-Free Wales: Tobacco Control Delivery Plan 2022-2024* would have on the Welsh language, specifically on opportunities for people to use Welsh and on treating the Welsh language no less favourably than English.

What effects do you think there would be? How could positive effects be increased, or negative effects be mitigated?

ASH Wales supports the use of the Welsh language, and believes all services, campaigns and literature should be made available in this medium.

Question 11
Please also explain how you believe the proposed strategy and delivery plan could be formulated or changed so as to have positive effects or increased positive effects on opportunities for people to use the Welsh language and on treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language, and no adverse effects on opportunities for people to use the Welsh language and on treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language.

ASH Wales supports the use of the Welsh language, and believes all services, campaigns and literature should be made available in this medium.

Question 12:
We have asked a number of specific questions. If you have any related issues which we have not specifically addressed, please use this space to report them:

Please enter here:

ASH Wales flags that the latest NSW adult smoking prevalence figures, which are included in the strategy's forward, should be treated with caution. The latest adult smoking prevalence figures mark a steep drop, when compared to previous years. This is partly due to Covid-19 changing the survey mode[145].

Recommendation:

- WG to treat the latest NSW smoking prevalence data with caution.

Responses to consultations are likely to be made public, on the internet or in a report. If you would prefer your response to remain anonymous, please tick here:

[145] NSW Adult lifestyle (National Survey for Wales) - comparability of results for 2020-21 with previous years 2022

References

1. ASH Wales. YouGov Survey 2021
2. NHS Wales. Health in Wales | New evidence shows that smoking remains the biggest cause of preventable ill health in Wales .2019
3. CRUK. Smoking prevalence projections for England, Scotland, Wales, and Northern Ireland, based on data to 2018/19 2020
4. Department of Health & Social Care. Advancing our health: prevention in the 2020s – consultation document - GOV.UK 2019
5. Scottish Population Health Directorate. Raising Scotland's tobacco free generation: our tobacco control action plan 2018-gov scot 2018
6. NI Department of Health. Tobacco control | Department of Health (health-ni.gov.uk) 2012
7. West R, Christmas S, Hastings J, Michie S. Developing general models and theories of addiction 2017
8. NSW . National Survey for Wales 2018-19: adult smoking and e-cigarette use 2019
9. SHRN. Report of the 2019/20 School Health Research Network Student Health and Wellbeing Survey 2021
10. Statistics and Research. Maternity and birth Statistics-Welsh Gov 2020
11. Statistics and Research. Maternity and birth Statistics-Welsh Gov 2020
12. SHRN. Report of the 2019/20 School Health Research Network Student Health and Wellbeing Survey 2021
13. Welsh Government .A SMOKE-FREE WALES - Our Long Term Tobacci Control Strategy for Wales 2020
14. Welsh Government. A SMOKE-FREE WALES - Our Long Term Tobacci Control Strategy for Wales 2020
15. Frazer K, Callinan J, McHugh J, Van Baarsel S, Clarke A, Doherty K, Kelleher C. Legislative smoking bans for reducing harms from secondhand smoke exposure, smoking prevalence and tobacco consumption, 2016
16. Bauld, L. Impact of smokefree legislation in England: Evidence review .2011
17. Callinan JE, Clarke A, Doherty K, Kelleher C. Legislative smoking bans for reducing secondhand smoke exposure, smoking prevalence and tobacco consumption Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews, Issue 4. Art. No. CD005992. DoI: 10.1002/14651858.pub2. 2010
18. Welsh Government. The Smoke-free Premises and Vehicles (Wales) Regulations 2020
19. Welsh Government. Smoke-free law: guidance on the changes from March 2021 GOV.WALES 2022
20. Welsh Government. Smoke-free law: guidance on the changes from March 2021 GOV.WALES 2022
21. Welsh Government. Smoke-free law: guidance on the changes from March 2021 GOV.WALES 2022
22. Welsh Government. Ban on smoking on hospital grounds comes into force in Wales | GOV.WALES 2021
23. Welsh Government. NHS smoking cessation services 2020-2021 2021
24. University of Ottawa Heart Institute. About OMSC | Ottawa Model for Smoking Cessation 2022
25. University of Ottawa Heart Institute. Program Effectiveness | Ottawa Model for Smoking Cessation (ottawaheart.ca) 2022
26. Greater Manchester Health & Social Care Partnership. Outcomes – The CURE Project 2019
27. Royal College of Nursing Wales. The Nursing Workforce in Wales 2020
28. Sheffer C, Barone C, Anders M. Training Nurses in the Treatment of Tobacco Use and Dependence: Pre- and Post-Training Results 2011
29. University of Ottawa Heart Institute. Primary Care | Ottawa Model for Smoking Cessation 2022
30. Welsh Government. A SMOKE-FREE WALES - Our Long Term Tobacci Control Strategy for Wales 2020
31. Hajek P, et al. A Randomized Trial of E-Cigarettes versus Nicotine-Replacement Therapy 2019
32. McNeill A, et al. Evidence review of e-cigarettes and heated tobacco products: Report commissioned by Public Health England 2018
33. Royal College of Physicians. Nicotine without smoke: Tobacco harm reduction 2016
34. Stephens WE. Comparing the cancer potencies of emissions from vapourised nicotine products including e-cigarettes with those of tobacco smoke 2017
35. ASH Wales. YouGov Survey 2021
36. UK Government. PHE publishes independent expert e-cigarettes evidence review 2018
37. NICE. Tobacco: preventing uptake, promoting quitting and treating dependence 2021
38. Royal College of Physicians. Nicotine without smoke: Tobacco harm reduction 2016
39. BBC News Article. E-cigarettes could be available on NHS to tackle smoking rates - BBC News 2021
40. Stephens WE. Comparing the cancer potencies of emissions from vapourised nicotine products including e-cigarettes with those of tobacco smoke 2017
41. Public Health England. Evidence review of e-cigarettes and heated tobacco products 2018: executive summary 2018
42. NSW. National Survey for Wales 2018-19: adult smoking and e-cigarette use 2018
43. Hartmann-Boyce J, McRobbie H, Butler AR, Lindson N, et al,. Electronic cigarettes for smoking cessation. Cochrane Database of Systematic 2021
44. NICE Recommendations on treating tobacco dependence | Tobacco: preventing uptake, promoting quitting and treating dependence | Guidance | NICE 2021
45. NSW. National Survey for Wales 2018-19: adult smoking and e-cigarette use 2018
46. Welsh Government. Welsh resident smokers who made a quit attempt via NHS smoking cessation services, by local health board and cumulative quarters within a financial year 2021
47. Welsh Government. Welsh resident smokers who made a quit attempt via NHS smoking cessation services, by local health board and cumulative quarters within a financial year 2020
48. ASH Wales. Digital Smoking Platform Report 2019
49. ASH Wales. Action on Smoking and Health -ASH Wales calls for financial incentives and additional support to stop pregnant women from smoking 2021
50. Mund M, Louwen F, Klingelhoefer D, Gerber A. Smoking and Pregnancy — A Review on the First Major Environmental Risk Factor of the Unborn 2013
51. Leonardi-Be, J et al., Exposure to Parental and Sibling Smoking and the Risk of Smoking Uptake in Childhood and Adolescence: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. 2011

52. Welsh Government. Maternity and birth statistics: 2020 | GOV.WALES 2021
53. Welsh Government. Maternity and birth statistics: 2020 | GOV.WALES 2021
54. Notley C, Gentry S, Livingstone-Banks J, Bauld L, Perera R, Hartmann-Boyce J . Incentives for smoking cessation (Cochrane Review)2019
55. Notley C, Gentry S, Livingstone-Banks J, Bauld L, Perera R, Hartmann-Boyce J . Incentives for smoking cessation (Cochrane Review) 2019
56. Tappin D, Bauld L, Purves D, Boyd K, Sinclair L, MacAskill S, et al. Financial incentives for smoking cessation in pregnancy: randomised controlled trial | The BMJ; 350: h134. 2015
57. Chamberlain C, O'Mara-Eves A , Oliver S , Caird J, Perlen S, Eades S, Thomas J. Psychosocial interventions for supporting women to stop smoking in pregancy 2013
58. ASH/YouGov. Smokefree GB Survey 2018
59. Smoking in Pregnancy Challenge Group. Evidence into Practice: Supporting smokefree pregnancies 2019
60. Goldstein A O, Gans S P, Ripley-Moffitt C, Kotsen C, Bars M. Use of Expired Air Carbon Monoxide Testing in Clinical Tobacco Treatment Settings Feb 1;153(2):554-62. 2018
61. Shahab L., West R., McNeill A. A randomized, controlled trial of adding expired carbon monoxide feedback to brief stop smoking advice: evaluation of cognitive and behavioral effects 2011
62. Smoking in Pregnancy Challenge Group Evidence into Practice:CO monitoring and data collection throughout pregnancy 2021
63. Hartmann-Boyce J, Livingstone-Banks J, Ordóñez-Mena J. Behavioural interventions for smoking cessation: an overview and network meta-analysis 2021
64. ASH UK .The Cochrane Review of behavioural interventions for smoking cessation, explained 2021
65. ASH Wales . Smoking Cessation and Mental Health 2017
66. Callaghan RC, Veldhuizen S, Jeysingh T, et al. Patterns of tobacco-related mortality among individuals diagnosed with schizophrenia, bipolar disorder, or depression 2014
67. Luciano A, Meara E . The employment status of people with mental illness: National survey data from 2009 and 2010. 65(10): 1201–1209. 2014
68. NHS Wales. Economic Consequences of COVID-19 Pandemic Outbreak on Health Indicators and Health Service Use in Wales 2020
69. ASH UK, PHE. Mental health, smoking and poverty in the UK:A report commissioned by ASH and PHE 2016
70. Welsh Government. A SMOKE-FREE WALES - Our Long Term Tobacci Control Strategy for Wales 2021
71. Welsh Government . Review of the together for mental health delivery plan 2020
72. Taylor G, et al. Change in mental health after smoking cessation: systematic review and meta-analysis. BMJ 348: g1151 2014
73. WHO . Management of physical health conditions in adults with severe mental disorders. WHO guidelines 2018
74. Taylor D, Paton C, Kapur S. Maudsley. Prescribing Guidelines. 11th Ed. Informa Healthcare 2012
75. Picciotto MR, Brunzell DH, Caldarone BJ. Effect of nicotine and nicotinic receptors on anxiety and depression - PubMed 13: 1097-1106. 2002
76. ASH Wales. Second-hand smoke exposure and smoking 2018
77. ASH Wales. Second-hand smoke exposure and smoking 2018
78. ASH UK. Its_time_to_talk_about_smoking_case_studies 2019
79. SHRN .Youth_smoking_and_vaping_in_Wales 2020
80. SHRN. Youth_smoking_and_vaping_in_Wales 2020
81. SHRN . Trends-in-youth-smoking-cannabis-use-and-their-association.2020
82. Long S, et al., Comparison of substance use, subjective well-being and interpersonal relationships among young people in foster care and private households: a cross sectional analysis of the School Health Research Network survey in Wales 2017
83. Department for Education and Department for Health. Promoting the health and well-being of looked-after children: Statutory guidance for local authorities, clinical commissioning groups and NHS England 2015
84. ASH UK & The Fostering Network. Joint Briefing on Foster Care, Adoption and Smoking 2016
85. NSW. National Survey for Wales 2018-19: adult smoking and e-cigarette use 2019
86. ASH Wales. Inequalities Briefing Paper 2019
87. ASH UK . New figures show each local authority how many people could be lifted out of poverty if they quit smoking 2015
88. Gruer L, Hart C, Gordon D, Watt G. Effect of tobacco smoking on survival of men and women by social position: a 28 year cohort study BMJ 2009
89. ASH UK . Health Inequalities Paper2019
90. Smith.C, Hill.S, Amos A. Stop Smoking Inequalities: A systematic review of socioeconomic inequalities in experiences of smoking cessation interventions in the UK. Cancer Research UK. 2018
91. Smith.C, Hill.S, Amos A Stop Smoking Inequalities: A systematic review of socioeconomic inequalities in experiences of smoking cessation interventions in the UK. Cancer Research UK. 2018
92. Hudson-Sharp N, Metcalf H. Inequality among lesbian, gay bisexual and transgender groups in the UK: a review of evidence 2016
93. ASH UK. Factsheet_Ethnic-Minorities 2019
94. ASH UK. Factsheet_Ethnic-Minorities 2019
95. Department of Health. Tackling health inequalities: Targeting routine and manual smokers in support of the public service agreement smoking prevalence and health inequality targets, 2009
96. Department of Health. Tackling health inequalities: Targeting routine and manual smokers in support of the public service agreement smoking prevalence and health inequality targets, 2009
97. Stat based off last ASH Wales NEMS Survey 2015.
98. HMRC. Stats obtained from HMRC by ASH Wales in January 2022.
99. ASH Wales. Sanctions to tackle tobacco duty evasion 2021
100. Welsh Government. tobacco-control-delivery-plan-for-wales-2017-to-2020. 2017
101. ASH UK Rationale for Raising the Age of Sale 2021
102. ONS. Adult smoking habits in the UK :2019. 2020
103. Public Health Wales. Smoking in Wales 2018
104. ASH Wales .YouGov Survey 2021 2021

105. Friedman AS, Buckell J, Sindelar JL. Tobacco-21 laws and young adult smoking: quasi-experimental evidence 2019
106. Fidler JA, West R. Changes in smoking prevalence in 16-17-year-old versus older adults following a rise in legal age of sale: findings from an English population study 2010
107. ASH UK Rationale for Raising the Age of Sale 2021
108. Fidler JA, West R. Changes in smoking prevalence in 16-17-year-old versus older adults following a rise in legal age of sale: findings from an English population study 2010
109. Beard E, Brown J, Jackson S, West R, Anderson W, Arnott D, Shahab L. Long-term evaluation of the rise in legal age-of-sale of cigarettes from 16 to 18 in England: a trend analysis 2020
110. SHRN. SHRN Survey 2019/2020 2021
111. ASH Wales Smoking & Young People - Action on Smoking and Health (ash.wales) 2022
112. Institute of Medicine, Public Health Implications of Raising the Minimum Age of Legal Access to Tobacco Products, 2015
113. Beard E, Brown J, Jackson SE, West R, Anderson W, Arnott D, Shahab L. Who would be targeted by increasing the legal age of sale of cigarettes from 18 to 21? A cross-sectional study exploring the number and characteristics of smokers in England. 2021
114. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. The Health Consequences of Smoking: 50 Years of Progress. A Report of the Surgeon General 2014
115. Leonardi-Bee J, Jere M, Britton J. Exposure to parental and sibling smoking and the risk of smoking uptake in childhood and adolescence: a systematic review and meta-analysis 2011
116. ASH Wales .YouGov Survey 2021 2021
117. NHS Wales. Smoking (quitting) with Help me Quit 2021
118. ASH UK, LandmanEconomics_Impact-of-levy-on-Public-Finances 2019
119. Featherstone HJ . Establishing a Smoke-free 2030 Fund . 2021
120. Featherstone HJ . Establishing a Smoke-free 2030 Fund . 2021
121. Wakefield MA, Durkin S, Spittal MJ, et al., Impact of tobacco control policies and mass media campaigns on monthly adult smoking prevalence. 2008
122. Durkin SJ, Biener L, Wakefield MA. Effects of different types of antismoking ads on reducing disparities in smoking cessation among socioeconomic groups. 2009
123. National Cancer Institute. The role of the media in promoting and reducing tobacco use. NCI Tobacco Control Monograph Series. Bethesda, MD: US Department of Health and Human Services, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, 1998
124. Atusingwize E, Lewis S, Langley T. Economic evaluations of tobacco control mass media campaigns: a systematic review 2015
125. Durkin S, Wakefield M. Commentary on Sims et al. (2014) and Langley et al. (2014) Mass media campaigns require adequate and sustained funding to change population health behaviours. 2014
126. RCP Nicotine without smoke: Tobacco harm reduction 2016
127. Brown J, Kotz D, Michie S et al. How effective and cost-effective was the national mass media smoking cessation campaign 'Stoptober'? 2014
128. ASH UK. Stoptober: ASH calls for more mass media campaigns to help smokers to quit 2016
129. ASH UK. Stoptober: ASH calls for more mass media campaigns to help smokers to quit 2016
130. RCP Nicotine without smoke: Tobacco harm reduction 2016
131. Sims M, Salway R, Langley T et al. Effectiveness of tobacco control television advertising in changing tobacco use in England: a population-based cross-sectional study. 2014
132. Welsh Government . Healthy Weight: Healthy Wales delivery plan 2021 to 2022. 2021
133. EU Commission. Single-use plastics 2019
134. ASH Wales. Wales' Beaches Worst in Great Britain for Cigarette Butt Litter 2021
135. Novotny TE, et al,. Cigarettes butts and the case for an environmental policy on hazardous cigarette waste. 2009
136. University of Bath .Astroturfing - TobaccoTactics 2022
137. University of Bath .Home - TobaccoTactics 2022
138. ASH Wales. SECOND OPEN LETTER TO MEMBERS OF THE SENEDD: JAPAN TOBACCO INTERNATIONAL 2021
139. Hirschhorn N. Corporate social responsibility and the tobacco industry: hope or hype? | Tobacco Control (bmj.com) 2004
140. WHO. Guidelines for implementation of Article 5.3 of the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control
141. WHO. Guidelines for implementation of Article 5.3 of the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control
142. Alebshehy R, et al., UKTI_Report_2021 2021
143. Department of Health and Social Care. The tobacco control plan for England 2011
144. Department of Health. Towards_a_Smoke_free_Generation_-_A_Tobacco_Control_Plan_for_England_2017-2022 2017
145. NSW Adult lifestyle (National Survey for Wales) - comparability of results for 2020-21 with previous years 2022